



County Hall  
Cardiff  
CF10 4UW  
Tel: (029) 2087 2000

Neuadd y Sir  
Caerdydd  
CF10 4UW  
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2000

## AGENDA

<b>Committee</b>	ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE
<b>Date and Time of Meeting</b>	THURSDAY, 16 NOVEMBER 2023, 4.30 PM
<b>Venue</b>	CR 4, COUNTY HALL - MULTI LOCATION MEETING
<b>Membership</b>	Councillor Owen Jones (Chair) Councillors Derbyshire, Gibson, Green, Lancaster, Lloyd Jones, Jackie Parry, Proctor and Wood

*Time  
approx.*

### 1 **Apologies for Absence**

To receive apologies for absence.

### 2 **Declarations of Interest**

To be made at the start of the agenda item in question, in accordance with the Members' Code of Conduct.

### 3 **Minutes** (*Pages 5 - 10*)

To approve as a correct record the minutes of the previous meeting.

### 4 **Transport for Wales - Cardiff Projects** (*Pages 11 - 26*)

4.35 pm

Information Briefing

### 5 **Nature Emergency/Biodiversity Update** (*Pages 27 - 30*)

5.35 pm

Information Briefing

### 6 **Urgent Items (if any)**

6.35 pm

### 7 **Way Forward**

6.40 pm

To review the evidence and information gathered during the meeting, agree Members comments, observations and concerns to be passed on to the relevant Cabinet Member by the Chair.

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

**8 Date of next meeting**

Thursday 7 December 2023 at 4.30pm

**D Marles**

**Interim Monitoring Officer**

Date: Friday, 10 November 2023

Contact: Graham Porter, 02920 873401, g.porter@cardiff.gov.uk

## **WEBCASTING**

**This meeting will be filmed for live and/or subsequent broadcast on the Council's website. The whole of the meeting will be filmed, except where there are confidential or exempt items, and the footage will be on the website for 6 months. A copy of it will also be retained in accordance with the Council's data retention policy.**

**Members of the press and public may also film or record this meeting.**

**If you make a representation to the meeting you will be deemed to have consented to being filmed. By entering the body of the Chamber or meeting room you are also consenting to being filmed and to the possible use of those images and sound recordings for webcasting, public information, press coverage and/or training purposes.**

**If you have any queries regarding webcasting of meetings, please contact Democratic Services on 02920 872020 or email [Democratic Services](#)**

This page is intentionally left blank

ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

6 JULY 2023

Present: Councillor Owen Jones(Chairperson)  
Councillors Derbyshire, Gibson, Green, Lancaster, Lloyd Jones,  
Jackie Parry, Proctor and Wood

13 : APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies were received from Shifa Shazad.

14 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

No declarations of interest were received.

15 : MINUTES

The minutes of the meeting held on 15 June 2023 were approved as a correct record and signed by the Chairperson, subject to the following amendments:

Replacement LDP item

10<sup>th</sup> bullet point – the addition of the words ‘for new developments’ after ‘Community Engagement Officer’.

11<sup>th</sup> bullet point amend ‘north / east west’ to read ‘north west / east’

16 : REPLACEMENT OF RECYCLING FLEET FOR RESIDENTIAL COLLECTIONS

The Committee received a report providing an opportunity for Members to note and discuss the Cabinet report titled ‘Replacement of the Recycling Fleet for Residential Collections’ in advance of the Cabinet report being presented to the Cabinet at its meeting on 13 July 2023. The report recommends that the Cabinet approve the phased purchasing of 41 new recycling collection vehicles over a three-year period with a value estimated at £9.7 million.

Members were advised that the current fleet of recycling and Refuse Collection Vehicles (RCVs) was procured in 2013/14 via a contract hire agreement. At the end of the agreement in 2018/19, the vehicles were purchased and maintained by Central Transport Services (CTS).

A proposal to upgrade the fleet was completed in 2021/22 in respect of Refuse Collection Vehicles (RCV’s) for ‘residual and garden waste. However, a decision in relation to food RCVs was deferred until there was clarification on how kerbside segregated recycling would be collected. Following the recycling pilot it was decided that the following vehicles are required to support the delivery of the Recycling for Cardiff Strategy:

- Split back RCV's to collect both containers (tins and plastics) and mixed paper/card
- Top loader vehicle, with noise insulated interior, for collection of glass
- Top loader vehicle, with sealed plastic interior, for collection of food

The preferred solution is for Central Transport Services (CTS) to purchase the replacement vehicles which will then be leased. CTS will provide ongoing support from within that service area's budget. Members were asked to note that, whilst the service would like to introduce electric RCV's, the capacity for recharging at Lamby Way is limited. Consequently, some fleet vehicles will be purchased and others would be leased to allow the service area some flexibility to replace diesel vehicles with electric when this is possible.

The Chairperson welcomed Councillor Caro Wild, Cabinet Member for Climate Change and Matt Wakelam, Assistant Director - Street Scene to the meeting. After a brief statement from the Cabinet Member the Chairperson opened the debate on this item. Those discussions are summarised as follows:

- Members asked whether the capacity for additional electric vehicle charging infrastructure at Lamby Way was cost prohibitive or restricted by the space available. The Assistant Director stated that the capacity is currently limited by the wider power grid network. It was not possible to increase the electricity supply to the Lamby Way sub-station without significant investment from Western Power to upgrade their power cabling. The service area is investigating the potential to provide recharging from renewable energy sources (solar and wind) from a Council managed facility adjacent to Lamby Way. This would result in a 'circular economy'. The provision of energy storage on site would also provide resilience in the event of power outages.
- Members asked whether smaller vehicles would be procured that are able to access residences where access is limited. The Assistant Director confirmed that a range of different sized vehicles would be purchased. The larger RCVs are narrow bodied to allow ease of access and smaller 7.5 tonne and 12.5 tonne RCVs will be deployed also. However, many access issues are related to problems caused by parked vehicles and this is being addressed in partnership with another service area with a view to improving access.
- Members noted that a number of vehicles would be disposed of. Members asked whether those vehicles would be sold in order to fund the purchased of the new vehicles. The Assistant Director stated that the vehicles in question are at 'end of life' and CTS will try to sell them on or scrap the vehicle for its scrap value. Members were advised that 25% of all vehicles leased in order to allow some flexibility to respond to changes in service demands.

- Members asked whether the future phased roll-out of the Recycling Strategy will require additional vehicles to be purchased as it progresses. The Assistant Director stated that the purchase will cover the segregated recycling aspect of the Recycling Strategy and no additional vehicles will be required. The procurement will take place in two phases – 40,000 properties adopt the changes in October 2023 and a further 80,000 in July to August 2024.
- Members asked whether delays in the procurement process could delay the roll-out of the segregated waste strategy. Members were advised that the target dates will be achieved. Vehicles will be leased initially in order to achieve the targets. The purchased vehicles will be used to cover the second phase of the roll-out primarily.
- Members requested further clarification of the service area's lease-back arrangements with CTS. The Assistant Director stated that the fleet management business plan dictates that it is more cost effective for CTS to purchase fleet vehicles and for service areas to lease them back using their revenue-based budgets. Responding to a question from the Committee, the Assistant Director confirmed that lease arrangements are flexible but notice periods are built-in to lease contracts – with shorter lease ending notice periods being more costly.
- Officers were asked whether the overall cost of refuelling vehicles would be reduced by converting to electric vehicles and whether this would result in the new vehicles be delivered at cost-neutral. Members were advised that the collection of separated glass will result in increased income. Currently co-mingled collections mean that glass needs to be processed at a cost of £15-20 per tonne. Segregated glass is sold at between £35-45 per tonne – a net gain of £60 per tonne approximately.
- Officers were asked to comment on the use of the split-back vehicles in terms of the proportion of the vehicles that is used to collect the different types of waste presented. Members were advised that the use of split-back vehicles does present some challenges as they fill up at different rates. Therefore 30% of the vehicles will collect plastic containers and tins and 70% of the vehicles will collect paper and card. Both streams will be compacted to maximise efficiency. During the pilot both collection methods were trailed. Waste collections crews indicated that they favoured the split-back method as collections are completed quicker in an urban setting.
- Members asked what were the main benefits to arise from the procurement of the new vehicles. Members were advised that segregated recycling would result in a reduced carbon footprint for residents. Waste represents around 3% of emissions in terms of carbon footprint. However, the mining and manufacturing of the raw materials used to make aluminium, glass and plastic represents 45% of the global carbon footprint, so reusing those materials will have a major

impact. Segregated waste collection will also prevent contamination of the waste recycling and remove the reliance on 27 million green plastic recycling sacks provided to residents annually. Removing contamination, mainly from food, results in a reduction of litter in the street scene as vermin and birds are no longer attracted to the reusable sacks. The Assistant Director indicated that the cleansing teams are being restructured and cleansing of the street scene will take place after collections in most settings.

- Members asked whether the vehicles being procured are the same vehicles used in other Welsh local authorities who are operating similar segregated recycling schemes. The Assistant Director stated that some other Welsh local authority areas are rural in nature and use a 'single pass' vehicle which collects all the segregated recycling in one visit. This works well where properties are dispersed, but there is less benefit in urban areas as the vehicles stay in streets for a longer period causing difficulties for passing traffic, etc. The model being adopted is similar to that being used in Swansea.
- Members asked whether any analysis has been undertaken on the emissions from the diesel vehicles being procured. Members were advised that the vehicles will cause emissions but the engines are the latest Euro 6 category engines and their emission standards are higher than older vehicles, which will be an improvement.
- Members asked whether the vehicles would be used until their 'end of life'. The Assistant Director stated that the transition to a fully electric fleet would take a number of years. The vehicles are being procured for the full life of the vehicles of between 5 and 7 years. Over that period there will be changes in the manufacture of electric vehicles, for example, manufacturers switching to silica insulation in batteries will allow faster charging of the battery. Electric RCBs are prototype vehicles and the authority is leading the way, in partnership with Welsh Government, in assessing how these vehicles perform and how efficient they are.
- Officers were asked whether reaching the net zero target by 2030 was achievable in Cardiff. The Assistant Director stated that the Council's carbon emissions are significant in certain areas but are limited. Some industries are outside of the control of the local authority. Net zero is achievable for the Council but recycling waste materials will help the city reduce its carbon footprint as a whole. The ambition for Wales is to create a circular economy, so that if Wales needs 100,000 tonnes of glass then that 100,000 tonnes is remanufactured in Wales. The Cabinet Member stated that the first meeting of LAEP (Local Area Energy Plans) convened recently and they set a baseline for Cardiff's energy use and how it will be decarbonised. LAEP received a presentation on energy use in the City and it was suggested that the Committee may like to receive that presentation at a future meeting.



- Members noted that there was no segregated recycling plan specifically for HMOs in the city. Officers were asked whether they were confident the vehicles being procured were suitable for HMOs in the absence of such a plan. The Assistant Director stated that some of the existing fleet will be retained to collect co-mingled recycling from HMOs. Once segregated recycling has been rolled out in standard housing the focus will switch to segregated recycling in HMOs. Currently, HMOs are given a number of bins, caddies and bags and residents present their waste individually. The service area is keen to ensure that the model adopted does not have an adverse impact on the street scene.
- Members asked whether the potential for a glass bottle deposit return scheme in Wales would affect the business case for the new vehicles. The Assistant Director stated that a bottle deposit return scheme would mean that the adopted model would need to be modified. However, a bottle return scheme is also intended to reduce littering. The Assistant Director did not consider this to be a significant issue, as if the amount of glass collected reduced by 50% following the implementation of such a scheme, then the number of vehicles would be reduced accordingly.
- The Assistant Director confirmed that the vehicles purchased from the Council's supplier which went into liquidation did provide value for money.

RESOLVED: That the Chairperson writes to the Cabinet Member on behalf of the Committee to convey any comments, observations and recommendations made during the way forward.

## 17 : COMMITTEE BUSINESS WORK PROGRAMMING

Members were asked to note the draft indicative work programme for the Committee. Members requested update reports on biodiversity and the central bus station be included on the work programme.

RESOLVED – That the report be noted.

## 18 : URGENT ITEMS (IF ANY)

No urgent items were received.

## 19 : DATE OF NEXT MEETING

Members were advised that the next Environment Scrutiny Committee is scheduled for 14 September 2023.

The meeting terminated at 6.15 pm

This page is intentionally left blank

**CYNGOR CAERDYDD  
CARDIFF COUNCIL**

**ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**

**16 NOVEMBER 2023**

---

**Transport for Wales ( TfW ) – Cardiff Bus Interchange updates**

---

<p><b>Appendix A is exempt from publication because it contains information of the kind described in paragraphs 14 and 21 of parts 4 and 5 of Schedule 12A to the Local Government Act 1972</b></p>
---

**REASON FOR THE REPORT**

1. To provide the Committee with an update in relation to the Cardiff Bus Interchange:

**STRUCTURE OF THE PAPERS**

2. Attached to this report are:
  - Appendix A – Presentation

**BACKGROUND**

3. Transport for Wales are working with Welsh Government, Cardiff Capital Region and local authorities across Wales to develop an integrated transport system, and are central to many transport improvements in Cardiff including the Bus Interchange , which they took ownership of in March 2023.
4. TfW also resource the Burns Delivery Unit which was established in January 2021, to take forward and accelerate the delivery of the 58 recommendations, (made by Lord Burns and the South East Wales Transport Commission), including a number that are Cardiff specific and regional recommendations that will also impact on Cardiff.
5. [The Burns Delivery Board Chairs Annual Report, January 2023](#) provides an update on activity during 2022, and notes priorities for 2023.
6. The [Council's Transport White Paper: Transport Vision 2030](#) – Changing how we move around a growing city, includes demographic information about how

the city is growing and the projects that are being taken forward to support this growth and the move away from private car use to more sustainable transport and active travel including improving bus services and doubling the number of bus users by 2030 (from 2018).

7. [‘Stronger, Fairer, Greener’](#) states that a greener city *‘is connected by convenient, accessible, safe sustainable transport options.’* Commitments to achieve this, that relate to the bus interchange, include:
  - Radically improve bus transport through introducing more priority measures, new services, and work with partners to introduce a standard £1 bus fare.
  - Develop and agree a new Bus Strategy for Cardiff.
  - Develop park and ride sites across the city.

## **ISSUES**

8. The Cardiff Central bus station closed in 2015 and since then there have been numerous delays for a variety of reasons until work on the new build started in 2019.
9. Since the closure a coach station has operated from Sophia Gardens and bus stops have been operation from various on-street locations across the city centre.

## **WAY FORWARD**

10. Representatives from Transport for Wales have been invited to make a presentation to update the Committee and answer Member’s questions.

## **Legal Implications**

The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not making policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to the Cabinet/Council will set out any legal implications arising from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be within the legal powers of the Council; (b) comply with any procedural requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d) be undertaken in accordance with the procedural

requirements imposed by the Council e.g. Scrutiny Procedure Rules; (e) be fully and properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

### **Financial Implications**

The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any financial implications arising from those recommendations.

### **RECOMMENDATION**

The Committee is recommended to:

- i. Consider the information in this report, and the presentation and any further information presented at the meeting; and
- ii. Determine whether they would like to make any comments, observations or recommendations on this matter to the Cabinet Member for Transport & Strategic Planning.

**LEANNE WESTON**

**Interim Deputy Monitoring Officer**

**10 November 2023**

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 14, 21 of Part(s) 4 and 5 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank



**CYNGOR CAERDYDD  
CARDIFF COUNCIL**

**ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**

**16 NOVEMBER 2023**

---

**BIODIVERSITY & NATURE UPDATE**

---

**REASON FOR THE REPORT**

1. To provide the Committee with an update in relation to actions that have been undertaken to address the nature emergency that was declared in November 2021 and progress in relation to the development of the Biodiversity and Resilience of Ecosystems Duty Plan.

**BACKGROUND**

2. In November 2021 Cllr Derbyshire proposed the following motion to Council, which was seconded by Cllr Henshaw:

*This Council Notes:*

*That the World is already warming at an alarming rate leading to more extreme weather conditions.*

*The 'Special Report on Global Warming of At a 1.5°C warmer world, 6% of insects 8% of plants and 8% of vertebrates would be lost; increasing to 18%, 16% and 8% respectively at 2°C warmer.*

- *Approximately 4% of the global terrestrial land area is projected to undergo a transformation of ecosystems from one type to another at 1°C of global warming, with 13% at 2°C.*
- *Biodiversity-related factors such as forest fires, extreme weather events and the spread of invasive species, pests and diseases also need to be taken into account. Many of those are already happening.*

*The latest State of Nature report published by RSPB and other partners in 2019 found that:*

- *Of 3,902 species assessed in Wales, 666 (17%) are threatened with extinction from Wales, and another 73 (2%) have gone extinct already.*
- *The average abundance of butterflies (33 species) has declined in Wales by 52% since 1976.*

*This Council further notes:*

*That Biodiversity was raised as an issue within the Council's decision to declare a Climate Emergency and forms a key part of our One Planet strategy.*

*The recommendations from the Environmental Scrutiny Committees exercise 'Managing Biodiversity in Cardiff', resulted in the Council accepting a wide range of recommendations aimed at protecting, enhancing, and promoting biodiversity.*

*The wide range of actions being undertaken as part of the council's Biodiversity and Resilience of Ecosystems Duty {BRED} Forward Plan, which will be updated in 2022.*

*That bold action to protect and enhance the biodiversity of Cardiff can deliver benefits in terms of wellbeing, in new jobs, economic savings and market opportunities.*

*The exciting new Coed Caerdydd project and that Cardiff Council has committed to working with partners to become a National Park City.*

*This Council therefore resolves to:*

- i. Declare a Nature Emergency in Cardiff.*
  - ii. Place biodiversity with equal prominence to climate change at the heart of decision making in Cardiff Council.*
  - iii. Make representations to the Welsh and UK Governments, as appropriate; to provide the necessary powers, resources and technical support to local authorities in Wales to help them successfully achieve this aim.*
  - iv. Continue to work with partners across the county, region and nationally to develop and implement best practice methods that can protect Wales' biodiversity. Including seeking a joint approach with neighbouring authorities.*
  - v. Work with local stakeholders including Councillors, residents, young people, businesses and other relevant parties, to develop a strategy aligned with One Planet and Coed Caerdydd with a target of no net loss of biodiversity. This will also explore ways to maximise the local benefits of these actions in other sectors such as employment, health, agriculture, transport and the economy.*
3. Amendments to the motion were proposed , although the votes on these were lost so the original motion was carried.
  4. Section 6 of the Environment (Wales) Act 2016 states that public authorities have a duty to maintain and enhance biodiversity and promote the resilience of ecosystems.
  5. To comply with the duty public authorities must prepare and publish a plan setting out what they propose to do to maintain and enhance biodiversity and promote resilience. The first of these plans was required in 2019 and then every three years and therefore due in 2022.

6. Local Nature Partnerships (LNPs) have been established in all Local Authorities and National Parks in Wales through the 'LNP Cymru' project funded by Welsh Government. The Cardiff Local Nature Partnership was formed in 2020 with the appointment of a Local Nature Partnership Coordinator and the creation of a Local Nature Partnership Steering Group. LNPs are an integral element in addressing the nature crisis in Wales, providing biodiversity advice; seeking funding opportunities and collaborations; supporting community groups to take action; and sharing information about nature-based projects, events and activities. LNPs are responsible for producing Local Nature Recovery Action Plans to complement and reinforce national nature recovery efforts at a local level.

## **ISSUES**

7. Since the declaration of the nature emergency no updates have been received by the Committee and the Committee has been informed that the One Planet Cardiff Strategy and annual reports focus solely on 'carbon reduction'.
8. The Biodiversity and Resilience of Ecosystems Duty report has been delayed for a number of reasons including the Ecologist post being vacant, and following appointment to the post the majority of their time being 'reactive'.

## **PREVIOUS SCRUTINY**

9. In September 2019 the Committee undertook a Task and Finish Inquiry in relation to Managing Biodiversity & Natural Environment in Cardiff<sup>1</sup> which Cabinet received on 23 January 2020 and a full response was agreed by Cabinet on 19 November 2020<sup>2</sup>
10. The report made 39 recommendations on which 19 were accepted, 16 partially accepted, 3 not accepted and 1 was noted.
11. No formal updates in relation to the accepted recommendations have been received.

## **WAY FORWARD**

12. The County Ecologist has been invited to make a presentation to the Committee and answer Member's questions.

---

<sup>1</sup> [Microsoft Word - Biodiversity - Summary Report - 09.12.2019 \(moderngov.co.uk\)](#)

<sup>2</sup> [Cabinet 19 Nov 2020 Scrutiny Response Biodiversity App 1.pdf \(moderngov.co.uk\)](#)

## **Legal Implications**

The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not making policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to the Cabinet/Council will set out any legal implications arising from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be within the legal powers of the Council; (b) comply with any procedural requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d) be undertaken in accordance with the procedural requirements imposed by the Council e.g. Scrutiny Procedure Rules; (e) be fully and properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

## **Financial Implications**

The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any financial implications arising from those recommendations.

## **RECOMMENDATION**

The Committee is recommended to:

- i. Consider the information in this report, and the presentation and any further information presented at the meeting; and
- ii. Determine whether they would like to make any comments, observations or recommendations on this matter to the Cabinet Member for Climate Change

**LEANNE WESTON**  
**Interim Deputy Monitoring Officer**  
**10 November 2023**